



## How the illegal totoaba trade in Hong Kong is pushing Mexico's vaquita to the brink of extinction

A Greenpeace East Asia investigation

### 1. WHY DID GREENPEACE EAST ASIA CONDUCT THIS INVESTIGATION?

The vaquita, a small porpoise found only in the upper Gulf of California in Mexico, is one of the world's most endangered mammals. In the past three years, half of the vaquita population has been killed by fishing nets, many of them set illegally to capture an endangered fish called totoaba. The most recent scientific report published in Aug 2014 by the international Vaquita Recovery Team (CIRVA) estimated that there are only 97 vaquitas alive in the wild. They are expected to go extinct by 2018 unless drastic steps are taken immediately.

Many vaquitas have died in nets set for totoaba, the giant endangered fish that can reach two metres in length and 100kg in weight. They are caught for their valuable swim bladders, which are largely believed to be smuggled out of Mexico, often through the United States, destined to Hong Kong and then China.

While the Mexican government has placed a two-year ban on destructive gillnet fishing in the vaquita's habitat, more needs to be done to save the vaquita, particularly in relation to the illegal fishing and smuggling of totoaba swim bladders.

Therefore, Greenpeace East Asia (hereafter 'Greenpeace') conducted two investigations in Hong Kong earlier this year in February and April to find out if totoaba swim bladders (CITES Appendix 1 species) were being sold and traded in Hong Kong, what would be the possible trade pattern and scale, and who would be the buyers and sellers if these smuggling activities were happening in Hong Kong. By getting a better understanding of the totoaba swim bladder's illegal trade, we would be able to push the concerned government parties (in Hong Kong, China, Mexico and US) to take concrete actions to address the issue.

### 2. METHODOLOGY

There are over 300 dried seafood stores in Sheung Wan, Hong Kong. To understand the market structure better, Greenpeace conducted an undercover investigation in February and April 2015, visiting around 70 stores. Greenpeace gained substantial amount of information through observation, interviews, follow-up meetings and social media communication.

### 3. GENERAL FINDINGS

From both investigation trips Greenpeace identified at least 13 shops (including both wholesalers and retailers) as potential sellers, among which seven were able to show our researchers dried totoaba bladder samples in the shop. Others sent photos of their inventory bladders, often stored in other regions (such as China or the USA), via Wechat. This investigation offers a snapshot of the market: these are just a few examples Greenpeace have come across which may or may not be enough to summarize the whole black market situation in Hong Kong.

Greenpeace covered the following districts operated mainly by these respective market players:

1. Wing Lok Street ( 永樂街 ) : Small scale retailers
2. Des Vouex Road West ( 德輔道西 ) : Large scale retailers
3. Bonham Strand East ( 文咸東街 ) : Small wholesalers that covers retail business
4. Bonham Strand West ( 文咸西街 ) : Large wholesalers
5. Ko Shing Street ( 高升街 ) : Chinese medicine wholesalers (e.g. Cordyceps, Ginsengs)

Remark: with an exception, Greenpeace also visited a shop in Tsuen Wan which is referred by one of the traders Greenpeace had talked to.

#### **The roles of wholesalers and retailers:**

The roles of wholesalers and retailers are distinct in the dried seafood market. While not all traders in Sheung Wan were knowledgeable about totoaba bladders, Greenpeace learnt that a few major wholesalers were relatively active players in the trade, and claimed they possessed large quantity of totoaba bladders in their warehouses. Apart from selling directly to individual customers, they also supplied to the smaller scale retailers who would charge a huge markup on top of the wholesale price. Most traders were highly aware of the originality and sensitivity of the product, and the bladders would never be displayed in public.

Greenpeace also found out that a number of retailers involved in the distribution claimed that the bladders of the endangered species were their “private collection” from many years ago. These shops tend to show us only one pair each time.

As a result of the scattered distribution, the price of money fish maws (totoaba) can vary a lot in the market. Bladders of similar size and quality can cost HKD40,000 in one shop and HKD120,000 in another.

#### **Weak Hong Kong customs:**

Almost all traders agreed that Hong Kong customs were very loose and had very little knowledge about the bladders. On the contrary, Chinese customs were much stricter and would need to be “dealt” with extra care. Some traders even claimed that Hong Kong customs on the contrary were “free entry”. Some shop owners stated that Hong Kong-China “illegal trade” was commonly arranged by the retailers and done by external

hires. They normally charged a fee of HKD2,000 -3,000 per bladder. Most smugglers would pack one to two pieces of bladder in a suitcase, wrapped around in plastic bags and layers of bubble wraps, sometimes with Chinese herbs.

**About the Mexico-Hong Kong trade:**

Greenpeace researchers were told during the investigation that the Mexico-Hong Kong trade was done by air and commonly arranged by the supplier from the Mexico side. Bladders were normally hand-carried by smugglers and delivered at the Hong Kong airport. Our upstream sources suggested that the fresh bladders were normally bought and smuggled by Mexican gangs to the US for processing, and Chinese immigrants in Mexico were involved in facilitating the trade (See Appendix 8a). We also learnt that some Hong Kong traders ordered dried bladders via middlemen, mainly Chinese Americans based in the West Coast of the US (Los Angeles or San Francisco). After online price negotiation, the products would then be arranged to be sent to Hong Kong. Delivery time was around one month. Small size bladders could be delivered in lot size of up to 10 pieces (70g x 10) while large size bladders came in pairs (300g-400g x 2).

**The majority of buyers were from mainland China:**

Majority of the traders confirmed that the key downstream market was in China. From all the interviews Greenpeace had done, money fish maws (totoaba) were “collection items” and not for consumption and they had great storage of value. Some traders mentioned that the price has fluctuated a lot since 2013, due to the anti-corruption campaign in China, but it was still considered to be relatively stable compared to other traditional delicacies such as shark fins and sea cucumbers. Others told us that the price dropped due to an influx of supply since 2013, after a number of Chinese citizens moved over to the coast of San Felipe in Mexico. In some places the price dropped by 70% over the past few years.

Greenpeace researchers had been told that money fish maws (totoaba), together with bird nests and cordyceps, were popular gifts among Chinese businessmen such as entrepreneurs and SOEs, in exchange for “Guang Xi” (meaning “relationship”) with officials. Money fish maw (totoaba) possessed the rarity and rumoured “medical value”, making it one of the most exquisite and sought after items. In the early days, sailors believed in dried fish bladders’ mythical medical value in ‘blood regeneration’ after birth, and many viewed them as family treasures that could be passed on from one generation to another. Nowadays they are sometimes considered a symbol of wealth and power.

#### **4. DETAILED FINDINGS**

Seven shops were able to show undercover Greenpeace East Asia researchers the dried totoaba bladders directly.

**NOTE: Photo evidence, as well as video evidence (with transcripts) can be found in Appendix, and via the URLs provided.**

All photos can be accessed from the Greenpeace photo library at: <http://bit.ly/1HyZYaq>

Video footage from Mexico: <http://bit.ly/1LjJali> and videos from Hong Kong: <http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg>

STORE	KEY FINDINGS	SPECIFIC PRODUCTS
<b>Store 1 – Retailer at Wing Lok Street</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The shop owner got the products from his friend who was an expert in money fish maw (totoaba) in Sheung Wan, in which he didn't set the price but his friend (i.e. the supplier) did; he only acted as a middleperson.</li> <li>The shop owner showed us four bladders, two 'young bladders' for sales and two 'old bladders' for demonstration.</li> <li>The shop owner was willing to accept a counter offer at HKD25,000 per piece, down from original HKD96,000. He also said he could ask for more supply upon confirmation of payment of the first two pieces.</li> </ul>	Fish maw 1 (see photo 1a): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 241g</li> <li>Years: 37</li> <li>Price: not for sale</li> </ul> Fish maw 2: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 86g</li> <li>Years: 3-5</li> <li>Price: HKD 96,000</li> </ul> Fish maw 3: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 83g</li> <li>Years: 3-5</li> <li>Price: HKD 96,000</li> </ul> Fish maw 4: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 446g</li> <li>Years: 5</li> <li>Price: &gt; HKD 500,000</li> </ul>
<b>Store 2 – Retailer at Wing Lok Street</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The shop owner was able to tell that the bladders were classified as CITES Appendix and they were more expensive and more appropriate as gifts. All of his customers were Mainland Chinese.</li> <li>Cordyceps and money fish maws (totoaba) were the most expensive dried seafood product, but prices had gone down slightly due to the anti-corruption campaign in mainland China.</li> <li>The shop owner said he could help smuggle the bladders to China. The Hong Kong customs was very weak but the Chinese customs was stricter (see Appendix: 2c).</li> <li>To smuggle cross the border, buyers only needed to sign an authorisation with the shop owner while they crossed the border together. This smuggling fee was around HKD2,000 (paid in cash) and the buyer would be guaranteed to be safe from 'trouble' (see Appendix 1: 2c).</li> </ul>	Fish maw 1 (see photo 2a): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 112g</li> <li>Years: 5-6</li> <li>Price: HKD 30,000</li> </ul> Fish maw 2 (see photo 2b): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 385g</li> <li>Years: 6</li> <li>Price: HKD 140,000</li> </ul> Fish maw 3 : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 376g</li> <li>Years: 6</li> <li>Price: HKD 140,000</li> </ul> Fish maw 4: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 370g</li> <li>Years: 6</li> <li>Price: HKD 140,000</li> </ul> Fish maw 5: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 392g</li> <li>Years: 6</li> <li>Price: HKD 140,000</li> </ul>
<b>Store 3 – Retailer at Bonham Strand East</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The shop owner presented two pieces of expensive and 40-year-old bladders to us. He specified these two pieces were from Pakistan not Mexico, but he acknowledged that there were bladders imported from Mexico, and their physical appearance were different – smaller, longer and thinner. These bladders were exceptionally popular in the Mainland.</li> </ul>	Fish maw 1 : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 344.5g</li> <li>Years: 42</li> <li>Price: HKD 400,000</li> </ul> Fish maw 2 : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 232.5g</li> <li>Years: 40</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>After cross checking with scholar expert in this species, we believed that those bladders are not from totoaba, though they have similar outlook.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Price: HKD 280,000</li> </ul>
<b>Store 4 – Retailer in Ko Shing Street</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The person we talked to was a Chinese doctor, specialised in selling bird nests, cordyceps and Chinese herbs. He made a call to his local contact immediately to enquire about the stocks, and confirmed over and over again that the products came from ‘the Americas’ and ‘along Mexico’.</li> <li>He told us that his friend had sold a piece of dried money fish maw (totoaba) at a price of HKD2 million to a Chinese customer directly.</li> <li>He described Hong Kong customs as ‘free-entry’, and stated they were very loose on dried seafood food products. These bladders were stored in check-in luggage, and sent over from Mexico to Hong Kong by air each month. He could also help send the products to China. He had an office in Guangzhou and would be able to deliver the products by San Francisco express. He mentioned there were bribes involved at customs.</li> </ul>	<p>Fish maw 1 (see photo 4a):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 370g</li> <li>Years: 2-3</li> <li>Price: HKD 150,000</li> </ul> <p>Fish maw 2 (see photo 4b):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 420g</li> <li>Years: 2-3</li> <li>Price: HKD 150,000</li> </ul>
<b>Store 5 – Retailer at Des Voeux Road West</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>This shop was well connected.</li> <li>We gathered that this type of fish maw (totoaba) was extremely popular in the mainland, most of their customers were from mainland China and they offered smuggling delivery service to their clients. The shop also sold directly to retailers in Guangzhou and Beijing.</li> <li>The shop usually hired people to carry these bladders, packaged in plastic bags over with suitcases, on direct flight from Hong Kong to Beijing. He explained that it was fine to bring fish maws to Beijing by airplane, as long as they were declared as ‘regular bladders’. Beijing airport customs normally accepted that, but it would be tricky to go through Lo Wu as they would be considered as parallel goods.</li> </ul>	<p>Fish maw 1 (see photo 5a):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 85g</li> <li>Years: new</li> <li>Price: HKD 33,000</li> </ul> <p>Fish maw 2 (see photo 5b):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 372g</li> <li>Years: 10-20</li> <li>Price: HKD 240,000</li> </ul> <p>Fish maw 3 :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 359g</li> <li>Years: 10-20</li> <li>Price: HKD 240,000</li> </ul>
<b>Store 6 -- Wholesaler and retailer at Des Voeux West</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The shop owner claimed he is a “private collector” of “money fish maw” (totoaba). He was aware that the trade was highly restricted in the US, and the US, but safe in China, Hong Kong and Singapore (see appendix 1. 6c)</li> <li>The shop owner stated that a piece of 600g of younger bladder was around HKD 200,000, and the older ones could get up to HKD1 million. The price has dropped significantly from three years ago due to an influx of supply, especially in 2014. He estimated the</li> </ul>	<p>Fish maw 1: (see photo 6a)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 505g</li> <li>Years: new</li> <li>Price: HKD 200,000 (price dropped from HKD 1m 4 years ago to HKD 500k 3 years ago to HKD 200k this year)</li> </ul> <p>Fish maw 2:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 510g</li> <li>Years: new</li> </ul>

	<p>annual trading volume to be around 100 'cater' (司馬斤). (see Appendix 1. 6b)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The shop owner could help us source small-sized (300g) young bladder from South America or the US and the delivery time would be around one week.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Price: HKD 200,000 (same price dropped as fish maw 1)</li> </ul> <p>Fish maw 3 :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 250g</li> <li>Years: new</li> <li>Price: HKD 58,000</li> </ul>
<p><b>Store 7 -- Retailer in Tsuen Wan</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The shop owner said that his "money fish maws" (totoaba) came from a friend in the US. The shop owner was aware that the bladders were restricted for export in the US, and had to be smuggled to Asia. He claimed his friend smuggled around three times a year, roughly 10-20 pieces per trip. (see Appendix 1: 7b).</li> <li>The shop owner was confident that the prices of totoaba would increase by 100% within 10 years. All these valuable bladders were extremely popular among the ultra-rich in Hong Kong. The shop owner had given an example from a few years ago (though not sure if it was specifically money fish maw [totoaba]). One of his clients bought a pair of high-end bladders at HKD680,000 from him, and auctioned out for HKD1.2 million for charity.</li> <li>The shop owner also told us the price had dropped drastically a few years ago, due to the influx of supply in the market. He also showed us a photo of a 600g (HKD1 million worth) bladder, age unknown, sold a few years ago. The most expensive money fish maw deal up to date was sold to a Thai Chinese person at HKD5 million (for decorative purposes).</li> </ul>	<p>Fish maw 1: (see photo 7a)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 367.5g</li> <li>Years: unknown</li> <li>Price: HKD 168,000 (price discounted to HKD 148,000)</li> </ul> <p>Fish maw 2: (see photo 7a)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: 240g</li> <li>Years: unknown</li> <li>Price: HKD 168,000 (price discounted to HKD 148,000)</li> </ul> <p>Fish maw 3: (another pair in another branch)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weight: around 370g</li> <li>Years: unknown</li> <li>Price: HKD 300,000</li> </ul>

## 5. How weak was HK customs (from Mexico)?

In order to get a better understanding of how aware Hong Kong customs is in relation to the trade of endangered species, Greenpeace tried to bring a similar type of fish swim bladder (but from a non-endangered species) from the US to Hong Kong. In doing so, Greenpeace received first hand information regarding custom's response.

In early May, a Greenpeace East Asia researcher bought four fish bladders in Chinatown in San Francisco. The researcher visited two 'Chinatowns': in San Francisco and Oakland. There were many shops selling fish bladders from America and most sold swim bladders from Mexico. The researcher bought four Mexican fish swim bladder in Oakland Chinatown at a total amount of USD228.

Greenpeace had different arrangements for the four fish swim bladders to test out the customs check:

- The first fish swim bladder was mailed from the US to Hong Kong on 27 April, and the parcel was received one week later on 8 May.
- The second fish swim bladder was mailed from Mexico to Hong Kong on 30 April, and was arrived in Hong Kong on 5 May.
- The third fish swim bladder was hand carried from the US to Hong Kong by air, and the fourth one was hand carried from Mexico to US and then to Hong Kong by air. Once landed in Hong Kong and the luggage was collected, the researcher went to the red passageway ('goods to declare') and showed the fish swim bladders to the customs officer. At first the researcher asked the officer about carrying alcohol to Hong Kong, the officer answered the researcher in details. But then the researcher asked "Can I also bring fish swim bladders to Hong Kong" and the officer said "no problem" and then guided the researcher to walk back to the green passageway.

From this personal experience of bringing and posting fish swim bladders from the United States of America and Mexico to Hong Kong, we could see that Hong Kong customs did not have any awareness of the fish swim bladder trade from Mexico or South America, which in turn reinforced what Greenpeace researchers had heard from the dried seafood traders that Hong Kong customs was weak and that "free entry" was largely possible.

**Appendix 1: Photo and video evidence**

Note: All photos can be accessed from the Greenpeace photo library at:  
<http://bit.ly/1HyZYaq>

Video footage from Mexico: <http://bit.ly/1LjJali> and videos from Hong Kong:  
<http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg>

	Item	Code	Description	Caption	Caption in Chinese
<b>1a</b>	Store 1 – Retailer at Wing Lok Street	GPOSTP1RC	Dried bladder 1 for Store 1	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. The photo is a piece of swim bladder shown to Greenpeace researcher by the trader, in which it is 37 years old, weight 241g and it comes from Pacific Ocean. The trader claimed that it is just for demonstration and not for sale.	香港綠色和平發現香港上環海味街有來自墨西哥的走私瀕危石首魚花膠出售。圖中花膠有三十七年歷史，重 241 克，產地來自太平洋，店主用作陳列，屬非賣品。
<b>2a</b>	Store 2 – Retailer at Wing Lok Street	GPOSTP1RD	Dried bladder 1 for Store 2	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. The photo is a pair of swim bladders packed in a wooden gift box shown to Greenpeace researcher by the trader, with the word “Money Fish Maw” on the box cover. The size of this fish swim bladder is 112g, comes from Mexico and costs HKD 30,000.	香港綠色和平發現香港上環海味街有來自墨西哥的走私瀕危石首魚花膠出售。圖中花膠包裝在木製禮盒內，上面寫有「金錢鱉」。圖中花膠重約 112 克，有五至六年歷史，價值三萬港幣。
<b>2b</b>	Store 2 – Retailer at Wing Lok Street	GPOSTP1RE	Dried bladder 2 for Store 2	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. The photo is a piece of swim bladder shown to Greenpeace researcher by the trader, in which it is 6 years old, weight 376g and costs HKD 140,000.	香港綠色和平發現香港上環海味街有來自墨西哥的走私瀕危石首魚花膠出售。圖中花膠重約 376 克，約六年歷史，售價為十四萬港幣。
<b>2c</b>	Store 2 – Retailer at Wing Lok Street	Video evidence GPOSTP1RS	<i>Store 2 Info: Hong Kong customs is weak, smuggling fee</i>	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to	



		<a href="http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg">http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg</a>	<i>from Hong Kong to China</i>	Hong Kong. In this footage, the trader told Greenpeace researcher that HK Custom does not post any restriction on buying illegal swim bladders, and the trader stated that he can arrange people to bring the product from Hong Kong to China if we pay HKD2000 more.  <b>Full transcript Appendix 2.a</b>	
/	Store 3 – Retailer at Bonham Strand East	/	/	/	/
<b>4a</b>	Store 4 – Retailer at Ko Shing Street	GPOSTP1RF	Dried bladder 1 for Store 4	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. The photo is a piece of swim bladder shown to Greenpeace researcher by the trader, in which it comes from Mexico, weight 370g, 2-3 years old and costs HKD 150,000.	香港綠色和平發現香港上環海味街有來自墨西哥的走私瀕危石首魚花膠出售。圖中花膠重約370克，來自墨西哥，有2至3年歷史，售價為十五萬港幣。
<b>4b</b>	Store 4 – Retailer at Ko Shing Street	GPOSTP1RG	Dried bladder 2 for Store 4	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. The photo is a piece of swim bladder shown to Greenpeace researcher by the trader, in which it comes from Mexico, weight 420g, 2-3 years old and costs HKD 150,000.	香港綠色和平發現香港上環海味街有來自墨西哥的走私瀕危石首魚花膠出售。圖中花膠重約420克，來自墨西哥，有2至3年歷史，售價為十五萬港幣。
<b>5a</b>	Store 5 – Retailer at Des Voeux West Road	GPOSTP1RH	Dried bladder 1 for Store 5	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. The photo is a piece of swim bladder shown to Greenpeace researcher by the trader, in which it comes from South America, weight 85g and costs HKD 33,000.	香港綠色和平發現香港上環海味街有來自墨西哥的走私瀕危石首魚花膠出售。圖中花膠來自南美洲，重約85克，售價為三萬三千港幣。
<b>5b</b>	Store 5 – Retailer at Des Voeux West	GPOSTP1RI	Dried bladder 2 for Store 5	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed	香港綠色和平發現香港上環海味街有來自墨西

	Road			Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. The photo is a piece of swim bladder shown to Greenpeace researcher by the trader, in which it comes from Mexico, weight 359g, 10-20 years old and costs HKD 240,000.	哥的走私瀕危石首魚花膠出售。圖中花膠重 359 克，來自墨西哥，有十年至廿年歷史，售約廿四萬港幣。
<b>6a</b>	Store 6 -- Wholesaler & retailer at Des Voeux West Road	GPOSTP1S2	Dried bladder at Store 6	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. The photo shows that the trader is introducing a piece of swim bladder to Greenpeace researcher.	香港綠色和平發現香港上環海味街有來自墨西哥的走私瀕危石首魚花膠出售。圖中海味街老關正展示瀕危石首魚花膠。
<b>6b</b>	Store 6 -- Wholesaler & retailer at Des Voeux West Road	Video Evidence: GPOSTP1RX  Access at: <a href="http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg">http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg</a>	<i>Info: Dried bladder value 200k, from Mexico &amp; US</i>	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. In this footage, the trader told Greenpeace researcher that illegal swim bladders come from Mexico and that piece costs HKD 200,000.  <b>Full transcript Appendix 2.b</b>	
<b>6c</b>	Store 6 -- Wholesaler & retailer at Des Voeux West Road	Video Evidence: GPOSTP1RP  Access at: <a href="http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg">http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg</a>	<i>Info: Price fluctuation of dried bladders</i>	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. In the footage, the trader told Greenpeace researcher the price fluctuation of illegal swim bladders in recent years. He stated that the supply of illegal swim bladders go up in the past 2 years, and therefore the current price has been declined, as compared to the price 3 years ago that a piece at least costs HKD 500,000.  <b>Full transcript Appendix 2.c</b>	
<b>7a</b>	Store 7 -- Retailer	GPOSTP1S3	Dried	A Greenpeace East Asia	香港綠色和平發現荃灣

	at Tsuen Wan		bladders 1 & 2 for Store 7	undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. The photo shows that the trader is introducing a pair of swim bladder to Greenpeace researcher.	海味店有來自墨西哥的走私瀕危石首魚花膠出售。圖中海味街老闆正展示一對瀕危石首魚花膠。
<b>7b</b>	Store 7 -- Retailer at Tsuen Wan	Video Evidence: GPOSTP1RR  Access at: <a href="http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg">http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg</a>	<i>Info: Smuggled from Mexico, clearly mention Totoaba and money fish maw</i>	A Greenpeace East Asia undercover investigation exposed Hong Kong market players involved in a global and illegal trade of endangered totoaba fish swim bladders from Mexico to Hong Kong. In the footage, the trader told Greenpeace researcher clearly that totoaba swim bladders from Mexico were illegal and smuggled from US to Hong Kong. The price of one piece had once up to HKD 5,000,000.  <b>Full transcript Appendix 2.d</b>	
<b>8a</b>	Interviews with fishing community in San Felipe, Mexico. March 16, 2015	GPOSTP1R7  Access via: <a href="http://bit.ly/1Ax8z16">http://bit.ly/1Ax8z16</a>		Interviews of various leaders from the fishing community talking about the existing Totoaba illegal fishing trade in Mexico. The vaquita, a rare porpoise found in the Gulf of California in Mexico, are being caught up in nets that are used to capture another endangered species called the totoaba, whose dried bladder are prized as a delicacy in China. <b>Transcript on demand</b>	

## Appendix 2.a – Video Evidence

Store 2 – Retailer at Wing Lok Street (2.c)	Access at: <a href="http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg">http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg</a>  ID: GPOSTP1RS
---	---

00:00	綠色和平: 但是我想問一下, 這些東西我怎麼拿回去呀? 因為有些人說可以拿, 有些人說不可以拿, 我都不知道 Greenpeace: But I want to ask, how can I carry this back? Because some said it is allowed and some said it is not allowed. I am confused.
00:09	老板: 你跟我買, 我有辦法幫你帶過去 Owner: You buy it here. I have my way to help you for the delivery.
00:12	綠色和平: 你幫我帶過去呀? Greenpeace: So you will help me to export?
00:17	老板: 到時候, 你在這個地方簽名, 你甚麼時候走, 我們跟你一起走過去, 幫你帶過關 Owner: So you will sign here. Let us know when you leave, we will go through the custom together. I will help carrying it for you.
00:25	綠色和平: 喔喔, 這樣子, 那樣子也可以 Greenpeace: Oh...Like this...This is okay.
00:31	綠色和平: 所以是香港的海關應該有問題吧? Greenpeace: So there would be problems for HK Custom?
00:33	老板: 香港的海關沒問題, 是中國的海關。香港的海關他不管你。 Owner: There is no problem for the HK Custom. The problem is on China Custom.
00:38	The HK Custom Officer won't trouble you. 綠色和平: 如果這東西被抓到了... Greenpeace: If we are being caught with this...
00:40	老板: 香港海關不理你。不會, 主要是中國海關。 Owner: No, HK custom officers won't pay attention to you. It is mainly about China Custom.
00:44	綠色和平: 下? 不會吧? 我在廣州人家說...香港才拿不走啊。。 Greenpeace: What? No way. I heard someone in Guangzhou said that you can't take this thing out of Hong Kong.
00:50	老板: 香港海關不管你, 只有白粉不可以帶。這個不是違禁品呀。但是在中國海關, 看到他, 他如果不讓你帶過去, 他會把你沒收 Owner: The officials in Hong Kong don't care, only drugs are prohibited. This is not a prohibited item. But in China, they won't let you cross the border if they found it out. The stocks would be forfeited.
01:08	綠色和平: 沒收不得了 Greenpeace: Then it will become a great problem.
01:11	綠色和平: 這個。。不會有問題吧? 因為我在... Greenpeace: Then...It won't be any trouble right? Because I have...
01:16	老板: 保證你們安全, 就是要帶點錢給人家賺 Owner: I can guarantee the safety...but the thing is you have to let others earn a little bit...
01:23	綠色和平: 下? 這我還要另外給錢? 多少錢? Greenpeace: What? I need to pay an extra? How much?
01:29	老板: 到時候如果你真的買成的話, 我才叫他過來 Owner: If you have confirmed the deal, I will ask him to come.
01:33	

	綠色和平:不會很貴吧
01:34	<b>Greenpeace: It won't be expensive, right?</b>
	老板:也不會很貴
01:35	<b>Owner: It won't be very expensive.</b>
	綠色和平:大約呢?
01:36	<b>Greenpeace: So around..?</b>
	老板:大約可能.....一個兩千塊吧,港幣兩千塊。
	<b>Owner: Around...probably...two thousands for each...2 thousands HK dollars...</b>

**Appendix 2.b – Video Evidence**

<b>Store 6 -- Wholesaler &amp; retailer at Des Voeux West Road (6.b)</b>	<b>Video Evidence: GPOSTP1RX</b> <b>Access at: <a href="http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg">http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg</a></b>
--	---

00:00	老板: 給你看一下幾克就可以了 Owner: It's ok to show you the gram(Chinese gram).
00:05	老板 2: 哎哎哎, 你弄成公斤給他看 Owner 2: Ah, ah, ah, you covert to kilogram and show them.
00:10	老板: 無所謂 Owner: Never mind
00:11	綠色和平: 五百零五克 綠色和平: 有多少? GREENPEACE: Five hundred and five grams. GREENPEACE: How many?
00:14	綠色和平: 五百零五, 這個”克”, 是吧? GREENPEACE: Five hundred and five. This is “Gram” (Chinese gram) right?
00:16	綠色和平: 那這個在大陸就有一斤了 GREENPEACE: So that is one catty.
00:17	老板: 是呀, 是呀 Owner: Yes, yes.
00:20	老板: 你看, 再切換了公斤, 有了, 一斤 Owner: You see, convert it to KG, yes, 1 catty.
00:29	老板: 這個就算一斤了 Owner: This counts as 1 catty.
00:34	老板: 這個也有的 Owner: This one as well
00:37	綠色和平: 五百二十五克 GREENPEACE: Five hundred and twenty-five grams.
00:39	老板: 這個..這個重一點點 Owner: This.. this one is a bit heavier.
00:42	老板: 這個..這個.. 綠色和平:這個你們放價多少錢? Owner: This... This... GREENPEACE: How much will you sell this?
00:46	老板: 二十萬一個 Owner: Two hundred thousand for one.
00:48	綠色和平:二十萬一個, 對不對? Greenpeace: Two hundred thousand for one, right?
00:56	老板: 總共有...呀..呀..有 20Kilo(公斤) Owner: Total...ah..ah.. have 20 Kilos.
01:03	綠色和平:有 20 公斤是吧 GREENPEACE: Have 20 kilograms, right?
01:06	老板: 20 公斤, 20 公斤 Owner: 20 kilograms, 20 kilograms.
01:07	綠色和平:有 20 公斤的貨 GREENPEACE: Have 20 kilograms stocks.
01:09	老板 2: 總共有... Owner 2: Totally have...

01:10	綠色和平:但是都是這麼大的嗎? GREENPEACE: But all that big?
01:11	綠色和平:有沒有小的? GREENPEACE: Do you have the smaller one?
01:12	老板 2: 還有, 還有些小點的了 Owner 2: Still have, still have some smaller.
01:15	綠色和平:好 老板:看看看...全部秤好了, 放在秤裡面給你們看呢 GREENPEACE: Good Owner: See see see... all weighed, I put them on the weight and show you.
01:20	綠色和平:喔, 好呀好呀 GREENPEACE: Oh, good good.
01:24	綠色和平:這個是哪裡來的? 產地知道嗎? GREENPEACE: Where does it come from? Do you know the origin?
01:28	老板&老板 2: 這個.....墨西哥呀...?墨西哥, 墨西哥 Owner & Owner 2: This... Mexico...? Mexico, Mexico.
01:34	綠色和平:墨西哥, 南美那邊來的, 幾年的? GREENPEACE: Mexico, so it's from South America. How old?
01:37	老板 2: 就是只有那邊有這個, 美國那邊就是 Owner 2: This is only available there, American that part.
01:40	綠色和平:美國那邊也有喔? GREENPEACE: This is also available in America?
01:41	老板 2: 對呀, 美國呀, 對呀, 美國呀 Owner 2: Yes, America, yes, America.
01:44	老板 2: 看看, 這個好漂亮的 Owner 2: See, this is so beautiful.
01:49	綠色和平:有 20 幾公斤啊! 嘩... GREENPEACE: 20 kilograms! Wow
01:55	老板: 20 幾公斤都是這麼大的 Owner: all are as big as this for those 20ish Kilos.

**Appendix 2.c – Video Evidence**

<b>Store 6 -- Wholesaler &amp; retailer at Des Voeux West Road</b>	<b>Video Evidence: GPOSTP1RP</b> <b>Access at: <a href="http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg">http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg</a></b>
--	---

00:00	老板 2: 這些東西我們自己買回來的 OWNER2: We bought these ourselves
00:04	老板 2: 收藏的 OWNER2: For collection
00:06	綠色和平:但是我是買賣的嘛 綠色和平:這樣子 GREENPEACE: But I am doing trade GREENPEACE: I see
00:10	老板: 上...上...上一年多呀 OWNER: La..la..last year there were many
00:13	老板: 那時候全都跑過來 綠色和平:那時候價錢便宜很多是不是? OWNER: All [the products] come here GREENPEACE: So that was must cheaper at that time right?
00:17	老板: 本來這個東西賣幾十塊的這個也要 OWNER: This originally sold at a few [ten] dollars
00:20	綠色和平:幾十塊 GREENPEACE: A few [ten] dollars
00:23	老板: 三年前這個起碼要...五十萬 OWNER: Three years ago, this was worth 500 thousands
00:26	老板: 就是這兩年多到不得了, 才這麼便宜 OWNER: It has an influx these two years, therefore it is so cheap now
00:30	綠色和平:那誰...誰...誰買得多呀你們 GREENPEACE: so who..who..who are your major buyers
00:32	老板: 誰買得多呀. 就是買來收藏, 還有有錢人買來吃, 保命呀這個東西 OWNER: Who are the major buyers. Those buying for collection, and the rich would buy them as delicacy. This can save lives!
00:40	綠色和平:中國裡面的人嗎? GREENPEACE: Are they people from China?
00:43	老板 2: 我先打個電話 OWNER: I make a call first
00:45	綠色和平:為什麼這兩年比較多呀? 你知道嗎? GREENPEACE: Why there has been more for these two years? Do you know?
00:47	老板: 就是那個偷...在美國做了...做了好多人呀. 這批是之前的. 剛好那個魚在那裡, 下蛋嘛 OWNER: Because those poa[chers]...in the US...Many [poachers] in the US...this slot was previous one, those fish would breed [aggregately] there..

**Appendix 2.d – Video Evidence**



<b>Store 7 -- Retailer at Tsuen Wan</b>	<b>Video Evidence: GPOSTP1RR</b>
	<b>Access at: <a href="http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg">http://bit.ly/1FrTMxg</a></b>

00:00	老板: 因為我們是從美國回來那一批, 就是我在美國的朋友帶過來的 Owner: Since we are those returned from the US, I have friends in the US to bring me [maws]
00:05	綠色和平: 喔喔.. Greenpeace: Ohh..
00:06	老板: 因為這些...是屬於..不能出口的 Owner: Because these...are restricted...from export
00:08	綠色和平: 那帶過來要多久? 5 月來不來得及? Greenpeace: So how long does it take to arrive? Would that catch May?
00:11	老板: 這些是不讓出口的, 這些是...是...是...是...偷運過來的 Owner: These are restricted in export, these are...are...are..are...smuggled
00:16	綠色和平: 不會吧..呀這些 Greenpeace: Oh no...these...
00:17	老板: 哎呀, 你看..看, 你看看就知道啦, 真正偷運過來的. 啊啊啊 Owner: Ah, look..look..you look at this and you know, these are smuggled. Ahhahh...
00:23	綠色和平: 大陸很多的喔, 這個 Greenpeace: There are many of these back in the mainland
00:25	老板: 大陸很多, 但是這些貨是美國, 墨西哥那邊出口不了的 Owner: There are many in the mainland, but these are from the US and Mexico that cannot be exported
00:28	綠色和平: 喔喔.. Greenpeace: Ohh..
00:29	老板: 是走私過來的 Owner: they are smuggled to here
00:30	綠色和平: 喔..所以需要點時間對不對? Greenpeace: Oh..so it takes time right?
00:33	老板: 是, 而且呢...這些一定要看質素呀 Owner: yes, and for these you have to check out the quality
00:35	綠色和平: 喔.. Greenpeace: Ohh..
00:36	綠色和平: 對呀, 我們這次來專門要看一下貨 Greenpeace: Yes, this trip we come deliberately to have a look on the products
00:39	綠色和平: 沒有遇得到, 可能 需要時間, 所以 想 5 月要的話.. Greenpeace: If it is not found, it may take time, so if I want it by May...
00:41	老板: 我知道, 你需要.. 你需要.. 什麼貨, 就是你需要什麼貨, 你們要...要跟我們講, 然後 我們去籌備. 就是呀, 這些貨報給你們聽 Owner: I know, what..what..do you need. That is, what products you need, you have to..have to tell us and then we can prepare. Like quoting these products to you.
00:52	綠色和平: 不瞞您說, 其實在年前我們也是有一些..但是畢竟.. Greenpeace: To be honest, we had some last year...but after all...
00:57	老板: 這些貨呢.. 綠色和平:...有些有差 綠色和平: 我看, 喔.. Owner: These products... Greenpeace: they are different Greenpeace: Let
01:01	

	me see, oh..
01:04	老板:是美國走私過來的, 綠色和平:這樣.. Owner: ..are smuggled from the US Greenpeace: I see..
01:06	老板: 這些叫.. 這些叫石首魚 Owner: These are called...called Totoaba
01:07	綠色和平:喔, 是這樣 Greenpeace: Ohh...I see...
01:12	老板: 在美國那邊, 這些叫石首魚...美國叫石首魚呀 綠色和平: 對 Owner: In the US, these are called Totoaba ... These are called Totoaba in the US Greenpeace: Right
01:18	老板: 就是那些...我們..香港人就叫金錢鰻, 有公有鰻... Owner: These...we...Hong Kong people call it Money Fish Maws, it can be divided as males and females
01:21	老板: 最貴的有 500 萬一隻 Owner: For the most expensive one would cost HKD 5 million
01:22	綠色和平: 有多大? Greenpeace: How large is it? 老板: 給你看看, 哈哈哈哈哈 Owner: Let me show you hahahahah