



Ranking criteria explained

The ranking criteria reflect the demands of the Toxic Tech campaign to the electronics companies. Our two demands are that companies should:

- clean up their products by eliminating hazardous substances;
- takeback and recycle their products responsibly once they become obsolete.

The two issues are connected. The use of harmful chemicals in electronics prevents their safe recycling when the products are discarded. Companies score marks out of 30, which are then re-calculated to give a mark out of 10 for simplicity.

The electronics scorecard ranks companies on:

Chemicals policy and practice (5 criteria)

1. A chemicals policy based on the Precautionary Principle
2. Chemicals Management: supply chain management of chemicals via e.g. banned/restricted substance lists, policy to identify problematic substances for future elimination/substitution
3. Timeline for phasing out all use of vinyl plastic (PVC)
4. Timeline for phasing out all use of brominated flame retardants (not just those banned by EU's RoHS Directive)
5. PVC- and BFR-free models of electronic products on the market.

Policy and practice on Producer Responsibility for taking back their discarded products and recycling (4 criteria)

1. Support for individual (financial) producer responsibility – that producers finance the end-of-life management of their products, by taking back and reusing/recycling their own-brand discarded products.
2. Provides voluntary takeback and recycling in every country where its products are sold, even in the absence of national laws requiring Producer Responsibility for electronic waste.
3. Provides clear information for individual customers on takeback and recycling services in all countries where there are sales of its products.
4. Reports on amount of waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) collected and recycled.

GREENPEACE

HCL Ranking = 6/10 <http://www.hclinfosystems.com>

HCL has moved up the ranking and are now the number one Indian company, edging ahead of WIPRO, the former leader amongst the Indian companies. HCL has made progress on many of the criteria, in particular on their commitments to phase out PVC and BFRs. HCL's support for legislation on Individual Producer Responsibility (IPR) is a welcome step. However there are areas which need improvement, especially disclosure of their chemical management plan and commitments to eliminate hazardous substances under the Precautionary Principle. HCL also needs to improve on its provision of detailed information to customers on voluntary take-back of their end-of-life products. Overall, HCL's improvements on its commitments are encouraging and we hope that it will continue to take positive steps in the future as well.

HCL Overall Score

	BAD (0)	PARTIALLY BAD (+1)	PARTIALLY GOOD (+2)	GOOD (+3)
Precautionary Principle				
Chemicals Management				
Timeline for PVC phase out				
Timeline for BFR phase out				
PVC-free and/or BFR-free models (companies score double on this criterion)				
Individual producer responsibility				
Voluntary takeback				
Information to individual customers				
Reports on amount of waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) collected and recycled				

HCL Detailed Scoring

CHEMICAL SCORE	BAD	PARTIALLY BAD	PARTIALLY GOOD	GOOD
Precautionary Principle		HCL refers to the Precautionary Principle but fails to score maximum points because of its weak definition; it does not propose complete bans but only curtailment of dangerous chemicals. http://www.hclinfosystems.in/hclesafe_chemical.html		
Chemicals Management		HCL scores only one point on Chemicals Management as it fails to publish its List of Banned/Restricted Substances and does not identify chemicals for future elimination; it also gives confusing information as to the extent of implementation of RoHS bans across all products and only passive support for hazardous chemicals elimination. http://www.hclinfosystems.in/hclesafe_chemicalsupp.html		
Timeline for PVC Phaseout				HCL has committed to "Complete Elimination by 2009" at; http://www.hclinfosystems.in/hclesafe_chemicalsupp.html
Timeline for BFR Phaseout				HCL has committed to "Complete Elimination by 2010" at; http://www.hclinfosystems.in/hclesafe_chemicalsupp.html
PVC free and/or BFR-free Models (companies score double on this criterion)		HCL refers to part elimination of BFRs and PVC from select models of optical drives and monitors but they do not provide information on the models that are PVC and BFR free. http://www.hclinfosystems.in/hclesafe_restricted.html		

EPR/Recycling Score	BAD	PARTIALLY BAD	PARTIALLY GOOD	GOOD
Support for Individual Producer Responsibility				HCL under sustainable development supports IPR legislation and offers its customers free recycling options. http://www.hclinfosystems.in/hclesafe_ipr.html
Provides voluntary takeback where no EPR laws exist			HCL scores 2 points for Voluntary takeback but fails to score top slot as no information is available about how the system works. http://www.hclinfosystems.in/hclesafe_ewaste.html	
Provides info for individual customers on takeback in all countries where products are sold			HCL fails to maintain the top slot as they have removed the FAQ from the Web site. http://www.hclinfosystems.in/hclesafe_drive.html#new	
Reports on amount of waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) collected and recycled		HCL reports on the amount of e-waste 'disposed' of monthly However, HCL scores only one point as information is not given on the quantities re-used or recycled, nor is it given as a percentage of sales. http://www.hclinfosystems.in/hclesafe_audit.html		

Wipro Ranking = 5.3/10 <http://www.wipro.in>

WIPRO has made no progress since the last ranking and has lost its position as the front-runner to HCL, amongst the Indian companies. WIPRO scores well for its good information on Voluntary take-back of its end of life products. On the downside, WIPRO still fails to gain any points for chemicals management or for products on the market that are free from the worst chemicals. Although it has made a commitment to phase out PVC and BFR by the end of 2009, this now needs to be backed up by a public chemicals management plan and products that are free from PVC and BFRs, rather than simply complaint with RoHS regulation. WIPRO also needs to come out in the open in support of legislation on Individual Producer Responsibility (IPR).

Wipro Overall Score

	BAD (0)	PARTIALLY BAD (+1)	PARTIALLY GOOD (+2)	GOOD (+3)
Precautionary Principle				
Chemicals Management				
Timeline for PVC phase out				
Timeline for BFR phase out				
PVC-free and/or BFR-free models (companies score double on this criterion)				
Individual producer responsibility				
Voluntary takeback				
Information to individual customers				
Amounts recycled				

Wipro Detailed Scoring

CHEMICAL SCORE	BAD	PARTIALLY BAD	PARTIALLY GOOD	GOOD
Precautionary Principle			Wipro has precautionary policy for phasing out dangerous chemicals but they are within the industry standards. http://www.wipro.in/products/greenpc/html/0002core.htm	
Chemicals Management	Provides no information on chemical management policy.			
Timeline for PVC Phase out				WIPRO will eliminate PVC in their products by end of 2009. http://www.wipro.in/products/greenpc/html/0002core.htm
Timeline for BFR Phase out				WIPRO will eliminate BFR in their products by end of 2009. http://www.wipro.in/products/greenpc/html/0002core.htm
PVC free and/or BFR-free Models (companies score double on this criterion)	WIPRO doesn't have any PVC or BFR free models on the market, although it provides RoHS-compliant products. http://www.wipro.in/products/greenpc/html/0002core.htm			

EPR/Recycling Score	BAD	PARTIALLY BAD	PARTIALLY GOOD	GOOD
Support for Individual Producer Responsibility			WIPRO refers to Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) but does not give any further information on what this means in terms of their policy. http://www.wipro.in/products/greenpc/html/0002core.htm	
Provides voluntary takeback where no EPR laws exist			Wipro has offered its customers in India to take-back their Wipro E-waste. Customers pay up to Rs. 170 for sending a typical PC back, but can also arrange to have it picked up free-of-charge by contacting their recycling partner. http://www.wipro.in/products/html/EWContactPartner.htm	
Provides info for individual customers on takeback in all countries where products are sold				Wipro customers can register online as well as contact their representatives at 16 locations. Also, a list of authorised recyclers has been put on the website. http://www.wipro.in/products/html/01EWDisposal.htm
Reports on amount of waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) collected and recycled		WIPRO reports on the amount of e-waste 'disposed' of but it fails to identify the quantities re-used or recycled, or to present the quantity as a percentage of sales. http://www.wipro.in/products/html/01EW_Quantity.htm		

Zenith Ranking = 2.6/10

Zenith moves up from bottom place with a zero score to third place amongst the Indian companies. Its scores have increased slightly by making a commitment to phase out PVC and BFRs by 2010 and offering voluntary take back to customers. Zenith should be congratulated on these first steps but needs to put policies in place on the Precautionary Principle and Individual Producer Responsibility. Zenith also needs to announce its Chemicals Management Plan and seriously needs to improve on information provided to customers.

Zenith Overall Score

	BAD (0)	PARTIALLY BAD (+1)	PARTIALLY GOOD (+2)	GOOD (+3)
Precautionary Principle				
Chemicals Management				
Timeline for PVC phase out				
Timeline for BFR phase out				
PVC-free and/or BFR-free models (companies score double on this criterion)				
Individual producer responsibility				
Voluntary takeback				
Information to individual customers				
Amounts recycled				

Zenith Detailed Scoring

CHEMICAL SCORE	BAD	PARTIALLY BAD	PARTIALLY GOOD	GOOD
Precautionary Principle	Zenith computers has now published a sustainability plan. However, there is no mention of the Precautionary Principle in its approach to Chemicals Management. http://www.zenith-india.com/sustainability.html			
Chemicals Management	No information provided			
Timeline for PVC Phase out				Zenith Computers promises its customers that it will stop using PVC and BFR in its PC models by year 2010. http://www.zenith-india.com/sustainability.html
Timeline for BFR Phase out				Zenith Computers promises its customers that it will stop using PVC and BFR in its PC models by year 2010. http://www.zenith-india.com/sustainability.html
PVC free and/or BFR-free Models (companies score double on this criterion)	No information provided			

EPR/Recycling Score	BAD	PARTIALLY BAD	PARTIALLY GOOD	GOOD
Support for Individual Producer Responsibility	No information provided			
Provides voluntary takeback where no EPR laws exist		Zenith Computers states that it offers recycling and disposal services for end-of-life Zenith products to all consumers and corporate clients. It is not clear whether take-back is offered for all of Zenith's customers or only for those in India. In addition, the information about whether a fee is charged is ambiguous. This information is not easily accessible from Zenith's main pages, see this link: http://www.zenith-india.com/recycling.html		
Provides info for individual customers on takeback in all countries where products are sold		Zenith Computer gives an email address for consumers and corporate clients to contact them about their recycling and conscious disposal services for end-of-life Zenith Products. No details about service points, retailers or drop off points are given. This information is also not easily accessible from Zenith's main page. http://www.zenith-india.com/recycling.html		
Reports on amount of waste electrical and electronic equipment (WEEE) collected and recycled	No information provided			

PCS Ranking = 0/10 <http://www.pcstech.com>

PCS Technology once again fails to score a single point on Greenpeace Guide to Greener Electronics. PCS Technology offers a range of products and services, including hardware manufacturing, software and networking, throughout India and globally through a branch network in USA, Europe, Africa, West Asia and UAE. They have also formed alliances with major OEMs such as HP and Acer. However, there is no mention of the environment on their website and nothing on the use of chemicals in their products or their policy on electronic waste. This is a bit surprising because Greenpeace has met with PCS officials and also sent two reminders about our new ranking guidelines. It seems that PCS is not yet willing to move on this issue.

Greening Electronics

Greenpeace wants to see electronics companies clean up their act.

Substituting harmful chemicals in the production of electronics will prevent worker exposure to these substances and contamination of communities that neighbour production facilities. Eliminating harmful substances will also prevent leaching/off-gassing of chemicals like brominated flame retardants (BFR) during use, and enable electronic scrap to be safely recycled. The presence of toxic substances in electronics perpetuates the toxic cycle – during reprocessing of electronic waste and by using contaminated secondary materials to make new products.

Until the use of toxic substances is eliminated, it is impossible to secure 'safe' recycling. For this reason, the points awarded to corporate practice on chemicals (five criteria, double points for PVC – and BFR-free models) are weighted more heavily than criteria on recycling.

Ranking regrading: Companies have the opportunity to move towards a greener ranking as the guide will be updated every quarter. However penalty points will be deducted from overall scores if Greenpeace finds a company lying, practising double standards or other corporate misconduct.

Disclaimer: Greenpeace's 'Guide to Greener Electronics' aims to clean up the electronics sector and get manufacturers to take responsibility for the full life cycle of their products, including the electronic waste that their products generate. The guide does not rank companies on labour standards, energy use or any other issues, but recognises that these are important in the production and use of electronics products.

For the latest version www.designouttoxics.org



©Greenpeace

GREENPEACE

Published by Greenpeace India, #60 Wellington Street, Richmond Town, Bangalore 560025, t +91 8041154861, f +91 8041154862
January 2008.